United Nations E/2016/SR.20

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
13 June 2016

Original: English

2016 session
24 July 2015-27 July 2016
Integration segment

Summary record of the 20th meeting
Held at Headquarters, New York, on Monday, 2 May 2016, at 3 p.m.

President: Mr. Shava (Vice-President) ..... (Zimbabwe)
Later: Mr. Jürgenson (Vice-President) ..... (Estonia)

Contents

Agenda item 8: Integration segment (*continued*)

Panel discussion: "Towards a paradigm shift in development"

General debate

This record is subject to correction.

Corrections should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent as soon as possible to the Chief of the Documents Control Unit (srcorrections@un.org).

Corrected records will be reissued electronically on the Official Document System of the United Nations (http://documents.un.org/).

16-07221 (E)

Please recycle

In the absence of Mr. Oh Joon (Republic of Korea), Mr. Shava (Zimbabwe), Vice-President, took the Chair.

The meeting was called to order at 3.10 p.m.

Agenda item 8: Integration segment (*continued*)

Panel discussion: "Towards a paradigm shift in development"

1. **Mr. Shank** (Head of Communications, United Nations Sustainable Development Solutions Network and Adjunct Professor, New York University School of Professional Studies' Center for Global Affairs), moderator, said that it was necessary to think about using a conversational and colloquial style to engage the public and civil society on their own terms, especially with regard to the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. In addition, the international community should pivot off of the news cycle to make the Sustainable Development Goals more relevant to daily life. The United Nations Sustainable Development Solutions Network was active in various American cities, including Baltimore, Detroit and San Jose, by aligning city objectives with the Sustainable Development Goals and ensuring that localization happened from the ground up, rather than the top down.

2. Regarding coordination, although certain climate advocates had lamented that only a handful of the Sustainable Development Goals were related to climate change, in fact they all contained important climate components. Further connections were needed, however, with the 2030 Agenda and the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in order to ensure financial and organizational efficiency across the Sustainable Development Goals. Crowdsourcing would be helpful to engage constituents and civil society in offering sustainable development solutions.

3. The international community did not yet appear to be truly comfortable with breaking down silos and must be willing to shift paradigms around innovative approaches and technological change, assessing the effects on business and policy-making communities.

4. **Mr. Zamora Rivas** (Permanent Representative of El Salvador to the United Nations), panellist, said that within the United Nations system, there had been several substantial changes that were transcendent for the future of humanity. Initially, the development of the social sciences had produced academic factionalism, but the economic, social and environmental pillars were an interconnected basis for change that superseded it. Traditional working methods at the United Nations involved forming a group of experts, chaired by two co-chairs (one from a developing country and one from a developed country) whose discussions, fostered by input from experts and Member States, led to proposals that were ultimately approved as documents in the General Assembly. However, the people were excluded from such working methods; a paradigm shift should move from the bottom up, seeking to take all people into account. Governments were increasingly consulting all sectors of society to determine global policies. In his country, for example, the policies for public safety and peaceful coexistence had been developed through public consultation, which provided recommendations that were later implemented by the President of El Salvador.

5. The United Nations was gradually moving away from its purely declarative function, using beautiful but generic language to make sweeping proposals, and was instead moving closer to the reality of ordinary people in its documents and processes. With regard to sustainable development, indicators were being developed to determine if Member States were truly accomplishing the concrete commitments they had made. The commitments contained in the Addis Ababa Action Agenda, the 2030 Agenda and the Paris Agreement marked huge steps forward in the development of global governance, though gaps remained to be addressed. In particular, a political dimension was necessary to address economic, social and environmental issues, as politics were a tool used to distribute power. While it was impossible to establish a single political framework, it was necessary to incorporate political commitments in all the processes required for the achievement of economic, social and environmental objectives.

6. **Mr. Nabarro** (Special Adviser to the Secretary-General on the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development), panellist, said that the 2030 Agenda was a political manifesto for the future of the world's population as well as the planet itself. It provided directives to ensure equitable prosperity and peace through partnerships and policies. The transformative, integrated and indivisible agenda required innovation, which was occurring in different ways, including through interconnected thinking; the use of mobile technology; cross-sectoral work; synergy across multiple stakeholders; multi-stakeholder arrangements

in social movements; public empowerment to hold representatives accountable; increasing disaggregation of progress data by gender and social group; innovative financing that attached all resources to different dimensions of the 2030 Agenda; a shift away from restrictive governance to empowering governance that began to heal society's wounds; and a new vision of how the international community saw itself. Sustainable development was not a finite and enclosed task, but one without end, where the world's role was to renew, refine and restore.

7. **Ms.** Minh-Thu **Pham** (Executive Director for Policy, United Nations Foundation), panellist, said that integration was the main shift that had occurred: conceptually, the international community had accepted that it must break down the silos between issues, between levels of governance, and between work sectors. It was clear from the various agreements signed in 2015 that climate and development could not be separated. Achieving the Sustainable Development Goals, ending poverty and ensuring economic growth all required taking appropriate action on climate. The Paris Agreement and the Addis Ababa Action Agenda emphasized a universal and inclusive approach, giving a role to civil society, the private sector, developing countries, developed countries, multilateral development banks and other partners in implementation. That marked a shift with regard to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), where developing countries had primarily been responsible for delivery. Finally, the shift towards leaving no one behind would ensure that questions of inequality were tackled.

8. Now that a conceptual agreement had been reached, the challenge was putting it into action. What had been successful in the past when translating broad, global goals into national goals were the promotion of ownership, the implementation of evidence-based policies, and the adoption of a bottom-up approach to convert the ambitious 2030 Agenda into specific national programme strategies and budgets.

9. Moving from conceptual understanding to the well-coordinated implementation of the right programmes and policies was a challenge, however. Coordination was one means of ensuring integration but was not always possible. The 17 Sustainable Development Goals and their 169 targets could be overwhelming for Governments trying to figure out where to start. It was necessary to look at evidence to determine where progress on one Goal could have causal and correlative impacts on other Goals. All actors must be engaged, including civil society and the private sector. The objective must be reaching the poorest and the most vulnerable first.

10. In terms of solutions, it was necessary to instil ownership by broadly communicating the Goals and connecting with multiple partners. The global review process at the high-level political forum on sustainable development would be important for promoting accountability. Partnerships should include as many stakeholders as possible in order to engage in creative problem-solving and draw on the best from different sectors, while reaping the benefits of new technologies. In addition, it was necessary to mobilize research institutions to produce evidence on what strategies were successful. While many research institutions in developing countries had amassed such evidence in their own countries, they must be brought into the United Nations system. Pilot programmes had been launched by the United Nations to help identify successful pathways. In general, the United Nations system must be supported in order to provide Governments with sufficient resources. Capacity should be built to collect and analyse data, especially disaggregated data. The United Nations Foundation was proud to host the new Global Partnership for Sustainable Data. Lastly, nothing could be accomplished without obtaining political support for increased financing, policy support, and the promotion of ownership.

11. **Mr. Shank** (Head of Communications, United Nations Sustainable Development Solutions Network and Adjunct Professor, New York University School of Professional Studies' Centre for Global Affairs), said that reporters wanted to hear evidence of success, rather than timelines and targets. Storytelling should be used to inform the press of what was happening in real time. Social media could be used to translate the esoteric nature of the Sustainable Development Goals into reality for the public.

12. **Mr. Deichmann** (Chief Economist and Co-Director of the *World Development Report 2016* of the World Bank), panellist, discussing the *World Development Report 2016: Digital Dividends*, said that it was commonly believed that new technologies would have a major impact on the achievement of development objectives, in particular with regard to implementing and monitoring projects. The report looked at agriculture, environment and smart cities, inter alia, with a view to communicating the major

efforts of policy analysis to a general audience. As with cinema, three things were necessary to tell a good story: a compelling narrative, many interesting details, and a useful moral.

13. Applying that to the report, few development stories currently unfolding were more compelling than the changes being wrought by new technologies in developing countries and illustrating the fundamental human desire to communicate. While the private benefits of technology were obvious, it was important to determine the value of such technologies for development more broadly.

14. The report also contained many interesting details about how the Internet and mobile technology were influencing development and addressed whether digital technologies were making firms more productive, providing more jobs and greater societal integration for people, and making Governments more efficient in terms of service delivery. There was evidence that digital technologies did provide more growth, more jobs, and better services. Digital technologies allowed work to be completed more quickly, more efficiently and often for less money. New technologies also reduced transaction costs, thus improving inclusion and reducing information asymmetry. Transaction costs near zero had allowed vast-scale enterprises such as online retailers to emerge, but there could also be socially relevant benefits to big data.

15. However, the benefits of new technologies had not reached everyone equally. Economists wondered why productivity growth had significantly declined despite the introduction of new technologies. With regard to the debate on inequality, new technologies had partially contributed to the hollowing out and polarization of labour markets; it should be determined whether they also contributed to rising inequality. Some governance indicators that had been expected to improve had instead worsened, such as the share of free and fair elections. Although there was great potential for the Internet to improve democracy and make the world a more inclusive place, for every country like Estonia that had successfully implement an e-governance system of service delivery, there were five other countries that had failed in that regard.

16. In order for digital technologies to have a major beneficial impact, analogue complements must be in place. Economically speaking, without a competitive business environment, there was often not enough investment in new technologies, especially in developing countries. A new education agenda should focus on teaching the right kind of skills that would not become outdated or replaced by the new technologies. Technology could only be effective for service delivery if Governments were willing and accountable. In the absence of analogue complements — good regulation of the business environment, skills training and accountability — the development impact of new technologies would often remain disappointing. With a strong analogue foundation, however, ample digital dividends could be harvested: faster growth, more jobs and better services.

17. **Ms. Iskenderian** (President and Chief Executive Officer, Women's World Banking), panellist, said that Women's World Banking had focused on empowering women through access to financial tools and services for over 35 years. Although Sustainable Development Goal 5 was the only Goal with a specific focus on gender, the issue of gender was in fact cross-cutting. Women felt more acutely many of the inequalities highlighted by the Sustainable Development Goals, including in health care, food security and poverty.

18. Financial inclusion was another cross-cutting issue that could greatly impact the achievement of the 2030 Agenda. According to the Global Findex financial inclusion database, in 2015, 700 million more people had gained access to formal bank accounts (compared to 2012); much of the increased access was driven by technological progress. India, for example, had benefited from the introduction of a unique biometric identification system and accounted for 370 million of those bank account holders.

19. Despite such exciting progress, however, the difference between men and women's access to finance had not changed at all. The financial gender gap remained at 9 per cent in developing countries and 7 per cent globally. The gap reached 28 per cent for women earning less than $2 a day. The persistent gender gap with regard to financial access was driven by a number of structural barriers that would require broad-based innovation to be dismantled.

20. Women controlled fewer assets, were much less likely to be employed, and if employed, were more likely to work in the informal sector. In addition, they faced legal and cultural limitations to financial independence, and were sometimes banned from land ownership or inheritance. A number of financial

technology solutions seemed promising with regard to providing alternative methods of credit scoring and loan repayment estimation. Moreover, women were harder to reach, often owing to their domestic responsibilities, cultural restrictions and the likelihood of residing in rural areas. Digital finance could be a powerful tool to bring financial services to women. Unfortunately, over 1.7 billion women did not own mobile phones; in general, women were 14 per cent less likely to own a phone in their own name than men.

21. Banks were less understood by women. Although many women aspired to have bank accounts, they simultaneously felt unwelcome in banks. To increase financial literacy, which was quite low for women in general, her organization had developed a soap opera in the Dominican Republic that included financial messages in its plot lines. After the first 18-week season of the soap opera had aired, there had been a 39 per cent increase in savings accounts opened by women.

22. Women were likewise poorly understood by banks. Because women in developing countries had less access to formal identification, they were far less likely to be able to satisfy the strict documentation requirements imposed by banks and regulators.

23. **Mr. Shank** (Head of Communications, United Nations Sustainable Development Solutions Network and Adjunct Professor, New York University School of Professional Studies' Centre for Global Affairs), asked the panellists to give an example of breaking down silos that they had witnessed, as well as one that they wished to see. The climate community must understand its relevance and engage with all sectors, connecting the Goals and effectively communicating them to the public.

24. **Mr. Deichmann** (Chief Economist and Co-Director of the *World Development Report 2016* of the World Bank), said that the report contained a case study on a rural development project in India with over one million beneficiaries. The project had involved villages intensively in research, data collection and monitoring, looking at economic and social issues, the implications of the caste system and the impact of climate change. Villagers had proposed survey questions that might have otherwise been overlooked by researchers, especially with regard to women's empowerment. Although technology played an important part in the project, the more exciting element was the leadership role played by villagers in developing questionnaires and collecting and analysing data.

25. By themselves, new technologies would not overcome long-standing development problems. It was therefore necessary to consider how technology fit into the broader development context and to focus on its analogue components.

26. **Mr. Zamora Rivas** (Permanent Representative of El Salvador to the United Nations) expressed the belief that it was by involving all different kinds of individuals in the conversation that the world would be able to eradicate poverty.

27. **Mr. Shank** (Head of Communications, United Nations Sustainable Development Solutions Network and Adjunct Professor, New York University School of Professional Studies' Centre for Global Affairs), said that the conversation regarding sustainable development often had to start at the local level with smaller objectives before it could address the Sustainable Development Goals and the 2030 Agenda.

28. **Ms.** Minh-Thu **Pham** (Executive Director for Policy, United Nations Foundation) said that developed countries that had traditionally been donors were now forced to examine their own data capacities to determine how to integrate the Sustainable Development Goals into national plans and programmes. As what was decided at the United Nations level was often seen as the responsibility of developing countries, it was quite a paradigm shift to see donor countries making changes to implement the Goals. Even small, homogenous and wealthy donor countries did not automatically meet the objectives of the 2030 Agenda or possess sufficient data capacity. She wondered how that shift would translate over time into interactions with development partners in developing countries.

29. She hoped that one day, all citizens in the world could go onto their mobile phone and see how their community was performing with regard to various development goals and provide relevant input. While such a broad platform was unlikely to be realized by 2030, the long-term ambition was to create a global review to ensure accountability at highly localized levels.

30. **Ms. Iskenderian** (President and Chief Executive Officer, Women's World Banking), elaborating upon the difficulties women often faced in meeting the identification requirements for bank accounts, said that four years earlier, the Central Bank of Nigeria had recognized that the country's financial system was

riskier and less stable because 70 per cent of its population was operating outside of the formal financial system. The Bank had then shifted its procedure from requiring extensive documentation and answers to over 50 questions to allowing bank accounts to be opened with simply a photograph on a cell phone, a name and an address. That had allowed many individuals, primarily women who worked in open-air markets, to open savings accounts, thus shifting the banking paradigm in Nigeria.

31. While better and gender-disaggregated data would be useful, it was frustrating to observe that although the existing data indicated that women were better savers, more loyal customers of financial institutions, bought more insurance and were better at repaying loans, they still had unequal access to finance. It was necessary to move past unconscious biases and shift the paradigm with regard to women's financial access.

32. **Ms. Vaz** (Research Officer, Oxford Department of International Development, University of Oxford), said that, as some of the targets of the Sustainable Development Goals referred to national objectives, it was difficult to establish comparisons. For instance, target 1.2 aimed to reduce poverty by 50 per cent according to national definitions. As national definitions would naturally vary, she wondered how the importance of context specificity should be balanced with the need to make comparisons across countries and projects.

33. **Mr. Deichmann** (Chief Economist and Co-Director of the *World Development Report 2016* of the World Bank), said that local initiatives that did not always have external validity were not mutually exclusive with global objectives. While too much time was currently spent on determining whether initiatives were aligned with the goals of national statistics offices and other large institutions, research should not go too far in the opposite direction, allowing local villages to make all the choices. It was perhaps the beginning of a new phase with regard to developing multi-dimensional poverty indicators that went beyond income and consumption.

34. **Ms.** Minh-Thu **Pham** (Executive Director for Policy, United Nations Foundation) said that it was always important to remember the reasons for a specific analysis or project. Comparing across countries would only be important in certain cases, while it was always important to look at progress within countries. Context-specific work should be emphasized if it was driving progress nationally.

35. **Mr. Zamora Rivas** (Permanent Representative of El Salvador to the United Nations) said that a landmark study conducted by the Institution of Nutrition of Central America and Panama on the nutrition of Central American farmers had allegedly discovered that the vast majority of farmers should have been dead as they did not obtain the minimum nutritional standards. However, the study had overlooked the nutritional contributions of the sun and mangoes, which grew abundantly in the country and were not a purchased foodstuff. The flawed study illustrated the problem of trying to measure everything with one indicator. A similar problem was faced by middle-income countries, which were measured by a single indicator and lumped together despite significant differences. It was necessary to determine a more useful indicator.

36. **Mr. Shank** (Head of Communications, United Nations Sustainable Development Solutions Network and Adjunct Professor, New York University School of Professional Studies' Centre for Global Affairs), said that revising gross domestic product (GDP) as the sole indicator of middle-income status would be a great step towards measuring progress.

37. The ONE NYC programme showed how many agencies could be integrated into a broad city-wide sustainability effort tackling a variety of issues such as affordable housing, climate and inequality.

38. Breaking down of silos had not yet been witnessed with regard to funding, which would be necessary in order to create synergies.

39. **Mr. Williams** (Director and United Nations Representative, World Vision International) said that his dream would be that four years hence, every corporation that accessed capital markets would be publicly judged for its performance with regard to the 17 Sustainable Development Goals.

40. **Mr. Zamora Rivas** (Permanent Representative of El Salvador to the United Nations) said that the United Nations system resembled a feudal society, with each agency director acting like a feudal lord and fighting for prerogatives and funding. While telling the whole world to shift paradigms, internally the United Nations was very reluctant to change.

41. **Ms.** Minh-Thu **Pham** (Executive Director for Policy, United Nations Foundation) said that the international community should think in terms of funding outcomes and a longer-term vision, rather than specific institutions or programmes.

42. **Mr. Shank** (Head of Communications, United Nations Sustainable Development Solutions Network and Adjunct Professor, New York University School of Professional Studies' Centre for Global Affairs), said that the Sustainable Development Goals should be made immediately relevant. There were many daily opportunities for breaking down silos and shifting paradigms.

43. *Mr. Jürgenson (Estonia), Vice-President, took the Chair.*

General debate

44. **Mr. Chandrtri** (Observer for Thailand), speaking on behalf of the Group of 77 and China, said that policy integration was central to achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals, making the integration segment particularly important as a platform for sharing experiences and making recommendations. Owing to its transformative and universal nature, the 2030 Agenda represented a paradigm shift, and an innovative and integrated approach would be needed to make meaningful progress in the three dimensions of sustainable development. The Group was therefore very disappointed that a discussion on national experiences in policymaking had not formed part of the segment.

45. Policy integration should aim at mutually beneficial outcomes in the economic, environmental and social spheres, and success in those areas went far beyond measurable economic growth. Implementation was a long-term process aimed at improving living conditions for current and future generations. Rather than simply focusing on a monetary cost-benefit analysis, methodologies should also strive for a more people-centred, balanced approach to policy integration to encourage greater resilience to external shocks. Sustainability should be given full consideration in order to preserve the environment for future generations.

46. The main challenge facing policy integration was that a "business-as-usual" approach would not work. National implementation of the 2030 Agenda would be severely tested by the need to strike a balance between the public and private sectors. Silos in traditional policymaking needed to be broken down and supportive institutional frameworks created. Developing countries, especially countries in special situations, would need assistance from the United Nations to overcome policy integration challenges. Given that it would be a long-term process, institutional and functional capacity-building programmes should also follow a sustained, long-term and demand-driven pattern. The role of the United Nations should include, upon request, technology transfer and technological guidance, facilitating best practice exchanges, and fostering proactive collaboration on cross-sectoral institutional policy frameworks. The Group urged development partners to place more emphasis on those areas.

47. Implementation at the national level would require a transformation that took account of the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities, as well as a favourable economic environment. Efforts should be made to improve global economic governance and support the equal participation of developing countries. Macroeconomic policies should also support an enabling environment for sustainable development. The implementation of innovation policies, meanwhile, would require an environment that supported information and communications technology and the expansion of capacity-building and technology transfer in developing countries.

48. The Group attached great value to innovative policy solutions based on culture and traditional knowledge and practices. It had a great deal of best practices and traditional knowledge to draw on, which could be offered as alternative development models and strategies. It also supported the rising trend of South-South and triangular cooperation, which fostered the sharing of best practices among the countries of the South, while also keeping in mind that those endeavours were complementary to and not a substitute for the main channel of cooperation between the developed North and the South.

49. Lastly, policy innovation and integration would also require better coordination and less duplication at the global level. The Council and the General Assembly should therefore work in a more coordinated and coherent manner. The Group called upon all participants and stakeholders to step up their efforts to create a more prosperous, just and environmentally friendly world that left no one behind.

50. **Mr. Dang** Huy Dong (Viet Nam), speaking on behalf of the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN), said that 2016 marked the launch of the ASEAN Community and the start of implementation of the 2030 Agenda by ASEAN, building on its overall success in achieving the Millennium Development Goals.

51. Policy integration was central to both endeavours. ASEAN stressed the importance of horizontal and vertical integration, which had resulted in enhanced institutional capacity, greater effectiveness and efficiency, a stronger secretariat and greater institutional presence. In its experience, regional policy integration involved effective goal setting, policy design, implementation and evaluation based on strong leadership and a shared vision. ASEAN had formulated a number of joint initiatives in cross-border education, which had led to concrete, measurable results thanks to strong coordination.

52. With the aim of integrating the 2030 Agenda into ASEAN regional planning, a five-year plan of action (2016-2020) to implement the Joint Declaration on Comprehensive Partnership between the Association of Southeast Asian Nations and the United Nations had been agreed in December 2015.

53. Regional cooperation was essential to tackling many development problems, such as climate change. Yet regional policy integration posed a huge challenge owing to differing levels of development and needs. Both at the national and regional levels, obstacles included fragmentation, silos and a lack of innovative capacity and resources. Countries were working individually and together to address those challenges.

54. **Mr. Al-Musawi** (Iraq) said that the Sustainable Development Goals had been adopted in a new, innovative and unique spirit, namely, that no one would be left behind, sending a clear message that the Agenda applied to everyone, regardless of political, social, economic and cultural differences. The 17 Goals could be achieved only if everyone worked together. Implementation of the 2030 Agenda would require an integrated, innovative approach on three levels: vision, implementation and evaluation.

55. The Agenda was the product of a very ambitious, integrated vision that aimed to transform the world by freeing it from poverty, hunger, disease and need, where all life could prosper and was free of fear, and where everyone knew how to read and write. The main objective had been to draw up an Agenda that was in the interests of the people and the planet, and to make peace and prosperity a reality, in line with the preamble of General Assembly resolution 70/1 (2015).

56. Regarding implementation, an approach to breaking down silos might call for new implementation methodologies. However, any new methodology must take advantage of the interrelatedness of the goals and create synergies. Resources assigned to achieving Goal 1 (eradication of poverty), for example, would also have an impact on Goal 2 (eradication of hunger). Such interrelationships should be exploited.

57. Challenges could arise from breaking down silos and an innovative, integrated approach would be needed, which would involve the innovative management of the available human and material resources. Who, how and when were very important questions at every stage of implementation, to avoid wasting resources. Optimal use of resources was the indicator of success.

58. Concerning evaluation, while the 17 Goals were interrelated and integrated, they were also comprehensive and universal in nature, and not directed at a single region or segment of society. They applied to everyone, which should be taken into account during their implementation and evaluation. Goal 4, for example, involved providing every community with good-quality education, while taking into account its specific characteristics. A one-size-fits-all approach would not work.

59. **Ms. Bajgarova** (Czech Republic) said that a number of important international agreements had been concluded in 2015, making it the year of multilateral diplomacy. Among all the instruments adopted, however, the 2030 Agenda occupied a very special position: it was a holistic plan that involved everything and everyone. The time had come to translate those agreements into day-to-day business and deliver on the pledges made.

60. The Economic and Social Council and its integration segment were a crucial platform for implementing the 2030 Agenda, given that the Council served as a link between different bodies and its mandate was to integrate the three dimensions of sustainable development within the United Nations system and beyond.

61. The key to success lay in three areas. First, the Sustainable Development Goals were fundamentally different to the Millennium Development Goals and the Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, and far more complex, which would require a change of mindset. Second, mainstreaming the Goals within the existing structures would be far more relevant than creating new institutions and bodies. Third, maintaining policy coherence would present a challenge, but long-term prosperity outweighed short-term benefits.

62. Although the 15-year period established for achieving the Sustainable Development Goals appeared to provide ample time, work must begin immediately. Countries already had the necessary resources at their disposal; all that was required was to use them well.

63. **Ms. Hua** Ye (China) said that the 2030 Agenda had established a blueprint for international development cooperation. It was now up to the international community to translate commitment into action and fully launch the implementation process on the basis of win-win cooperation.

64. Each country had full sovereignty over its development and its implementation of the 2030 Agenda, and had the right to formulate an appropriate development strategy that was in line with the international development agenda.

65. Poverty eradication should remain the top priority, as it affected basic survival and increased the capacity for development. Implementation of sustainable development and coordination of its economic, social and environmental spheres should be guided by the principles of common but differentiated responsibilities and respect for national conditions and capabilities. In addition, development partnerships should be optimized and developed countries should fulfil their official development assistance commitments without delay. While North-South cooperation should remain the main channel, South-South and triangular cooperation should be strengthened, and the participation of the private sector and other stakeholders should be scaled up.

66. It was important to finalize the coordination mechanism for development. Development policy should be incorporated into global macroeconomic policy, to increase the voice and representation of developing countries. The United Nations development system and its specialized agencies, funds and programmes should enhance development resources and use their own advantages to facilitate the implementation of the 2030 Agenda and advance international development cooperation in line with their mandates.

67. With regard to follow-up of the global implementation process, the high-level political forum on sustainable development should play a key role, and progress towards commitments on development financing, technology transfer and capacity-building should be comprehensively reviewed. At the national level, assessment should allow for policy flexibility, to enable experiences to be shared in a constructive manner.

68. China had already made progress in implementing the 2030 Agenda and had incorporated it into its Thirteenth Five-Year Plan and into its national mid- to long-term development strategies. In addition, it had established an intersectoral coordination mechanism for implementation composed of 43 government institutions.

69. The Government was committed to facilitating international development cooperation, including South-South cooperation. As President of the Group of 20 for 2016, China would make the 2030 Agenda a priority, aiming to facilitate better cooperation within the Group and to take the lead in implementing the Agenda.

70. **Mr. Abbas** (Lebanon) said that the Government of Lebanon had begun drafting a national sustainable development plan in 2014, and was now aligning it with the 2030 Agenda and the Sustainable Development Goals.

71. The plan covered public services and the main economic sectors in Lebanon, and each chapter took stock of existing programmes, analysed their shortcomings and presented alternatives where appropriate. One chapter would be dedicated to data collection and analysis, particularly ways in which the national statistical office could be strengthened. The final section of the plan would include draft legislation for implementing each of the reforms. The plan would cover all 17 Sustainable Development Goals, but those that were more urgent for Lebanon would receive greater attention.

72. The plan would be financed through public-private partnerships, privatization, domestic and

international private sector investment, concessional financing from multilateral development institutions, and domestic public spending. The United Nations development system would play a crucial role in building national capacity and facilitating technology transfer, which would support implementation and follow-up.

73. Lastly, a whole chapter of the plan would be dedicated to the mass displacement crisis that had engulfed Lebanon and its economy in recent years. Addressing the crisis was a challenge that could not be met by Lebanon alone but rather would require a collective international effort to provide short-term humanitarian assistance and longer-term development financing on concessional terms. Failure to take such action would no doubt hinder the proper implementation of the 2030 Agenda and the national sustainable development plan in the years to come.

74. **Ms. Arrieta Munguia** (Observer for Mexico) said that the United Nations needed to address its own internal resistance to breaking down silos that prevented it from acting as one organization. With two months to go until the high-level political forum on sustainable development, the integration segment was an opportunity to bring the discussions from various processes together, in particular regarding the functions of the Economic and Social Council and the General Assembly. The themes of innovation and integration were highly relevant and should guide thinking within the United Nations.

75. As the coordinating body of the United Nations system and development activities, the Council should ensure that country and regional offices worked in coordination and human and financial resources were not spread too thinly, in order to obtain the best results and maximize the implementation of the 2030 Agenda. Given the Council's wide experience in the implementation of large-scale strategies, sharing the most successful practices in designing methodological tools would be very useful for less developed countries. The Council could also play a role in facilitating triangular cooperation.

76. **Mr. Fathalla** (Observer for the League of Arab States) said that countries must work together to achieve prosperity for their peoples. The League of Arab States had established a programme for implementation of the 2030 Agenda, in collaboration with Egypt and the United Nations development bodies, and had highlighted key challenges that would impinge on implementation of the Agenda.

77. With regard to the eradication of poverty, all resources must be mobilized to ensure that no one was left behind, on the basis of universal principles of international cooperation such as common but differentiated responsibilities and respect for specific national characteristics. An integrated methodology must be adopted that covered the three dimensions of sustainable development.

78. The world today, especially the Arab world, was facing political and security challenges that represented obstacles to implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals and must not be neglected. The primary challenge was the occupation of Arab countries by Israel; those nations would need support in order to achieve the Goals. Conflicts constituted a further challenge, which also had an adverse impact on neighbouring countries. Strengthening cooperation was a crucial element of combating terrorism and addressing its root causes.

79. Countries had differing scientific capacities and capacities for science and technology development; greater progress was needed in developing countries and technology transfer should be facilitated. Global partnerships should be strengthened and financial resources mobilized. It was important to help States strengthen their capacity for high-quality, disaggregated statistical production, analysis and reporting, which would enhance decision-making and foster the development of methodologies and mechanisms for data collection, transfer and exchange. The aim was to create new, innovative tools that would allow for greater transparency, thereby transforming the Goals into concrete action. The success of the Agenda depended above all on combating terrorism and saving young people from terrorism and extremism.

80. Lastly, South-South cooperation would be important in implementing the Sustainable Development Goals. Each State had to decide on its own priorities in each dimension, on the basis of universal principles and its own specificities.

81. **Mr. Marobe** (South Africa) said that the immediate and central goal of South Africa was to end poverty and hunger and achieve sustainable development in its three dimensions, by promoting inclusive economic growth, protecting the environment

and promoting social inclusion in a drive to move from commitments to results.

82. South Africa had gained a head start in the implementation process, in particular regarding the three challenges of poverty, inequality and unemployment, thanks to its adoption of a national development plan in 2012, which was aligned with the Sustainable Development Goals and served as a platform for implementation of the 2030 Agenda and Agenda 2063: The Africa We Want.

83. National efforts were premised on empowering all stakeholders to contribute to the collective effort. Annual performance plans of implementing government departments had been adjusted to focus on outcomes rather than activities, while national development targets and indicators had been streamlined to improve the quality of reporting. South Africa would also be placing more emphasis on performance monitoring and strengthening participatory democracy through its implementation of a citizen-based monitoring framework, an innovative and integrated approach to monitoring government performance.

84. The principle of common but differentiated responsibilities lay at the heart of the Sustainable Development Goals, highlighting that the Goals were universal but each country's starting point was different. Developed countries must continue to support developing countries in their implementation of the Goals through provision of the necessary means.

85. In order to end poverty within a generation, enable every individual on the planet to live a life of dignity, combat climate change and set the world on a sustainable course, meaningful collaboration on technological solutions was essential. In that regard, South Africa looked forward to the outcomes of the first multi-stakeholder forum on science, technology and innovation for the sustainable development goals, to be held in June 2016, which had been mandated by the Addis Ababa Action Agenda of the Third International Conference on Financing for Development and the 2030 Agenda to address the potential of science, technology and innovation to achieve the Goals.

86. Developing countries needed support to disaggregate indicators and analyse data. A stronger science-policy link was crucial, as it would help solve problems, integrate the three dimensions of sustainability and establish them within different social practices and production systems. It was also vital to provide concrete support to the Technology Facilitation Mechanism; multi-stakeholder partnerships were an essential element of delivering sustainable development results that were equitable and aligned to national and regional needs.

87. Africa would need support to ensure that no one was left behind and to achieve sustainable development and inclusive economic growth. Integrated implementation, follow-up and review of both the 2030 Agenda and the African Union Agenda 2063 would be required at the regional level. Regional processes and United Nations bodies should support the regions in assessing progress, sharing lessons learned and identifying ways to accelerate implementation while also lessening the reporting burden and duplication.

88. South Africa welcomed the vertical and horizontal integration of women in almost all the Goals. Policy innovation and integration would play a key role in driving progress towards gender equality through stronger legislation, policies and institutions and scaled-up financing for sustainable development initiatives by women.

89. Lastly, the high-level political forum on sustainable development should ensure that Member States received the necessary support to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals by 2030, and the outcomes of the integration segment should help Member States and international bodies to play their part in the global effort.

The meeting rose at 5.25 p.m.

United Nations E/2016/SR.21

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
20 May 2016

Original: English

2016 session
24 July 2015-27 July 2016
Integration segment

Summary record of the 21st meeting
Held at Headquarters, New York, on Tuesday, 3 May 2016, at 10 a.m.

President: Mr. Jürgenson (Vice-President) ..... (Estonia)

Contents

Agenda item 8: Integration segment (*continued*)

Discussion on "Leaving no one behind: National perspectives on policymaking" (panel 1)

This record is subject to correction.

Corrections should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent as soon as possible to the Chief of the Documents Control Unit (srcorrections@un.org).

Corrected records will be reissued electronically on the Official Document System of the United Nations (http://documents.un.org/).

16-07222 (E)

Please recycle

In the absence of Mr. Oh Joon (Republic of Korea), Mr. Jürgenson (Estonia), Vice-President, took the Chair.

The meeting was called to order at 10.10 a.m.

Agenda item 8: Integration segment (*continued*)

Discussion on "Leaving no one behind: National perspectives on policymaking" (panel 1)

1. **The President** said that the panel discussion, entitled "Institutional frameworks and policy planning" would address the institutional and governance frameworks necessary for the effective integration of the economic, social and environmental dimensions of sustainable development with a view to the successful implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. The panel would also consider how policy innovation and integration could inform national strategic frameworks and policy planning in order to advance the implementation of the 2030 Agenda.

2. **Mr. Donoghue** (Permanent Representative of Ireland to the United Nations and co-facilitator of the Post-2015 Development Agenda), moderator, said that discussions at various levels were continuing about how to implement the recently adopted 2030 Agenda, including the structures needed for the success of the Sustainable Development Goals, and that the holding of the high-level political forum on sustainable development in July 2016 would help to drive that momentum forward.

3. While the 2030 Agenda had set out broad guidelines on follow-up and review, many questions related to implementation remained unanswered. During the next phase it would therefore be necessary to decide, inter alia: which systems should be put in place at the United Nations; what organs should be restructured; how delivery efforts would be funded at the multilateral level; what could be done at the regional level; what individual Member States should do both domestically and externally to play their role in the universal agenda; and how the full range of stakeholders, including civil society, the private sector and the scientific community, could be engaged in that process.

4. The report by the Secretary-General, entitled "Critical milestones towards coherent, efficient and inclusive follow-up and review at the global level" (A/70/684), was an important contribution to that ongoing debate and he commended the Ambassadors of Denmark and Belize for their effective work as co-facilitators for the process to take decisions on the most critical issues addressed in the report.

5. The integration segment provided a welcome opportunity to look at implementation in a holistic manner through a series of panel discussion focusing on key areas. His own country, Ireland, was currently considering the institutional frameworks and policies that it would need in order to implement the Sustainable Development Goals. He looked forward to learning from the national voluntary presentations of other countries at the forthcoming high-level political forum.

6. All countries would clearly need to elaborate transparent and inclusive processes which ensured that every voice was heard and which fostered awareness and ownership of the 2030 Agenda among ordinary citizens. Parliamentary engagement would be an important component in that regard. Furthermore, the national systems in place must work actively to break down silos and recognize that policy impacts in one area, such as agriculture, could have adverse impacts on others, such as the environment. Other important dimensions, such as human rights and gender equality, must also be addressed holistically.

7. Lastly, he recalled that the guiding questions for the discussion were as follows: how current institutional arrangements could be adapted to promote integrated policy and decision-making, and what the possible incentives might be for doing so; how institutional arrangements could effectively incorporate existing and new knowledge, and be translated into policy solutions to reduce poverty and advance sustainable development; what the challenges were to policy integration and how those might be addressed; how the benefits and trade-offs could be assessed ex-ante to inform policy choices, and ex-post to inform implementation; and what concrete tools could be used for that purpose.

8. **Mr. Cardona** (Sectorial Minister for Social Development and Inclusion of Honduras), panellist, said that the past two years had been very difficult for Honduras owing to the combined impact of climate change, the El Niño phenomenon and unprecedented droughts throughout the country. In response, the Government had issued emergency provisions and assistance to areas where crops had been completely

destroyed and was also promoting programmes for the sustainable development of agriculture. Furthermore, to address the overall situation, the Government was implementing State policies to reduce extreme poverty and improve the quality of life, to ensure the sustainable use of land and water, and to finance micro, small and medium-sized producers.

9. His Government had horizontally linked the priorities of the Country Vision and National Plan 2010-2038, the Strategic Plan 2014-2018 and the Sustainable Development Goals, with responsibility for the latter being shared among the various government offices dealing with social and economic development, decentralization and infrastructure. Moreover, to ensure that no one was left behind, a plan had been drawn up for the implementation of the Goals in each of the country's six regions.

10. The challenge ahead would be for every country to similarly transform the Sustainable Development Goals into national policies. The implementation and follow-up of the Goals could be facilitated by their incorporation into the educational curricula of all countries.

11. **Mr. Dang** Huy Dong (Deputy Minister, Ministry of Planning and Investment of Viet Nam), panellist, said that all nations faced opportunities and challenges in the context of promoting new integration and innovation policies for the 2030 Agenda. His Government, for example, was preparing a master plan that would localize the Sustainable Development Goals, in line with the Socioeconomic Development Plan 2016-2020, and in which the corporate sector would have an important role to play.

12. Historically, the Vietnamese centrally planned economy had relied strongly on State-owned enterprises. However, as a result of the reforms implemented over the past 30 years, their share of the economy had declined. At the same time, increased foreign and local investment had led to the rapid development of the private sector, which now accounted for over 70 per cent of the gross domestic product of Viet Nam. The policy of privatizing and reforming State-owned enterprises had thus proven to be extremely effective by creating additional jobs. The funds raised from such privatization initiatives, amounting to around $3 billion, had been redistributed by the Government to social sectors, including the education and health sectors. In that context, he recalled that legislation on enterprises in Viet Nam had also recently been amended to promote the development of social enterprises.

13. As part of its ongoing poverty reduction efforts, the Government was encouraging crowdfunding platforms for community development. Each community webpage was not only sponsored by a lead donor but also provided an opportunity for an interactive dialogue between individual donors and recipients.

14. Lastly, he noted that the Government had established a social safety net policy and a contingency policy to meet the population's emergency needs.

15. **Mr. Alter** (Director of the Public Governance and Territorial Development Directorate, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) Secretariat), panellist, said that good governance remained relevant for good policy performance and that both were dependent upon reliable data, transparency, accountability, the rule of law and integrity.

16. However, in addition to building on those achievements, there was a need for institutional innovation. For example, the centres of Government in many countries were underperforming in terms of their coordination and monitoring of implementation. In the future, those centres would need to mainstream policies on the Sustainable Development Goals into their decision-making. Other crucial factors required for innovation included actors with leadership and vision, as well as data-based knowledge for making policy decisions. At the same time, it was important to have independent institutions in place that could provide Governments with credible, competent and valuable assessments.

17. Most countries no longer enjoyed the full trust of their citizens. However, trust was essential as a measure of Government performance and for the success of reform policies. In the final analysis, the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals must take such factors into account given that, in the words of Machiavelli, there was nothing more difficult than an attempt to introduce a new order of things.

18. **Ms. Persson** (Senior Research Fellow and leader of the global research theme "Transforming Governance", Stockholm Environment Institute), panellist, said that she represented a vibrant research

community that could be a valuable resource for policy integration inputs to Agenda 2030.

19. She noted that for policy integration to be effective it was necessary to evaluate past successes and failures; to achieve consistent policy outputs through the use of downstream tools, and to proactively identify synergies through the use of upstream tools; and to employ broader institutional arrangements for policy integration while simultaneously identifying specific opportunities for integrated policy outcomes.

20. Across all countries and cultures, political will and leadership were crucial for the adaptation of institutional arrangements to promote effective integration. While institutional arrangements could provide the necessary infrastructure for policy integration, they were insufficient to bring about integrated outcomes and it was ultimately political leadership that acted as the catalyst.

21. Policy integration could be institutionalized in public administration. However that was more than an administrative or technocratic task alone, as sometimes tough choices needed to be made that required value judgments and political accountability. Another consideration was that the adaptation of institutional arrangements could be a lengthy process, given the need for continuous re-evaluation. Unsuccessful policy integration could even result in policy dilution. For all those reasons, in implementing the 2030 Agenda, it would be important to remain self-critical and to learn from past mistakes.

22. Academic research typically analysed four dimensions of institutional arrangements: normative frameworks and political leadership; organizational changes in government administration; procedural tools, from the initial stage of policymaking to the implementation and enforcement phases; and cognitive efforts to facilitate learning over time. While some of the relevant downstream tools were already in place as safeguards against inconsistent policy outcomes, more upstream approaches would be needed to proactively identify the synergies in the 2030 Agenda. Countries would also need more practical and specific solutions to address their remaining policy inconsistencies.

23. **Mr. Radon** (Adjunct Professor of International and Public Affairs, Columbia University), panellist, said that policy innovation entailed not just the introduction of new ideas but also the sharing of ideas and of lessons learned about what approaches worked or did not work. Moreover, policymakers, who were often distanced from the actual impact of their decisions, must ensure that the voices of all those affected were heard. There were tools available to achieve that end but some of them, such as environmental impact assessments, needed refinement. For example, the assessment prepared prior to the BP oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico and the process by which it had been approved had been flawed in a number of ways. Environmental impact assessments should be widely disseminated so as to provide local communities with an opportunity to say how they would be affected by a given project and a benchmark against which they could hold companies to account for fulfilling their commitments. A similar process should be used to assess the likely impact of international investment agreements. All such assessment mechanisms should be backed up by a robust legal framework.

24. In efforts to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals, it was important to ensure equality of expertise around the world by, inter alia, using technology to share knowledge and data. Communication should take place not just among professions and ministries within one country but also among different countries and regions.

25. **Ms. Jung** Eun-hye (Republic of Korea) said that, in order to achieve the Sustainable Development Goals, cooperation and integration among the institutions that actually implemented them must also be sustainable. The role of governments was to construct an institutional framework for gathering ideas from both the public and private sectors and putting them into practice. Each country should also have a national strategy for achieving the Goals; her Government had adopted such a strategy to guide the country's policies for the next 20 years. Furthermore, a national committee on sustainable development within the Office of the Prime Minister was coordinating the efforts of the various ministries and agencies involved in implementing the Goals.

26. **Mr. Talbot** (Guyana) said that policy integration, which was one of the key dimensions of the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals, required vision and a willingness to act, and also structures that were flexible enough to evolve over time. He would welcome the panel's views on the risks associated with policy integration, such as policy

dilution and the potential for confusion over the allocation of responsibilities. His Government was in the process of developing a strategy for the achievement of the Goals and was pursuing a green agenda. It was also working on the establishment of development hubs in each of the country's 10 administrative regions with a view to bridging the divide between the coast and the hinterland, ensuring that services reached scattered populations and connecting all communities to the national development effort.

27. **Mr. Fowlie** (International Telecommunication Union) said that technology needed to be harnessed for the purposes of sustainable development but was too often siloed from policy and the private sector. The *World Development Report 2016: Digital Dividends* contained statistics showing that a country's gross domestic product (GDP) could be boosted by increased Internet coverage, but only if policy and technology were integrated, for example through the privatization of Internet service providers and the adoption of government policies to build capacity and technical expertise in digital technology. It was also imperative to apply the "dig once" principle, whereby pipes for Internet cables were laid at the same time as other hard infrastructure was built. Policies to promote market competition and public-private partnerships would also help to integrate technology into the development process.

28. **Ms. Persson** (Senior Research Fellow and leader of the global research theme "Transforming Governance", Stockholm Environment Institute), responding to the comments made by the representative of Guyana, said that policy integration must be effected properly and in a democratic way, taking account of the different priorities of different stakeholders with a view to avoiding conflict. Controls and checks should be enforced, and good use should be made of downstream integration tools such as environmental impact assessments.

29. With regard to the risk of diffusion of responsibility, she said that in Sweden the Government had identified 16 national environmental objectives and had delegated them to different sectoral authorities for implementation. That approach had worked well but had incurred high transaction costs.

30. **Mr. Cardona** (Sectorial Minister for Social Development and Inclusion of Honduras) said that, under his Government's communications policy, some 80 per cent of the country's schools had been equipped with broadband Internet connections by 2014, and public parks had been provided with Wi-Fi coverage. Those results had been achieved through public-private partnerships, which could also be harnessed to implement the Sustainable Development Goals.

31. **Mr. Dang** Huy Dong (Deputy Minister, Ministry of Planning and Investment of Viet Nam) said that information technology was an important tool for increasing transparency in policy implementation and could help reduce the cost of checks and balances. In Viet Nam, an e-government system was being established, which allowed for quick and easy online registration of companies. A public procurement portal had also been set up, which was helping to increase transparency in the procurement process.

32. **Mr. Alter** (Director of the Public Governance and Territorial Development Directorate, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development Secretariat) said that policy integration had both upside and downside risks, the costs and benefits of which should be properly evaluated. All decisions should be evidence-based. Integration would require increased investment of time and resources, while the important process of ensuring that all voices were heard could slow down implementation. On the other hand, the risks of policy dilution could be reduced if the decision-making process was front-loaded. That meant conducting evaluations at an early stage of the policy cycle so as to learn from both successes and failures and avoid mistakes in future cycles.

33. The United Nations Conference on Housing and Sustainable Urban Development (Habitat III), to be held in Quito in October 2016, was an opportunity to ensure that integration was a key consideration in the building of communities and cities for the next 20 years. The focus should be not only on buildings and infrastructure but also on how economies and societies would function in the future. Long-term impacts should be evaluated upfront.

34. **Mr. Radon** (Adjunct Professor of International and Public Affairs, Columbia University) said that the Sustainable Development Goals were complex; a team effort was required in order to implement them successfully. The role of governments was to create an enabling environment through the adoption of appropriate laws and policies. Risks could never be

eliminated completely, but they needed to be properly managed. As previously mentioned, ideas should be shared and all voices should be heard so as to give people a greater sense of ownership of processes that affected them.

The meeting rose at 11.35 a.m.

United Nations E/2016/SR.22

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
27 May 2016

Original: English

2016 session
24 July 2015-27 July 2016
Integration segment

Summary record of the 22nd meeting
Held at Headquarters, New York, on Tuesday, 3 May 2016, at 3 p.m.

President: Mr. Jürgenson (Vice-President) ..... (Estonia)

Contents

Agenda item 8: Integration segment (*continued*)

Discussion on "Leaving no one behind: National perspectives on policymaking" (panel 2)

This record is subject to correction.

Corrections should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent as soon as possible to the Chief of the Documents Control Unit (srcorrections@un.org).

Corrected records will be reissued electronically on the Official Document System of the United Nations (http://documents.un.org/).

16-07305 (E)

Please recycle

In the absence of Mr. Oh Joon (Republic of Korea), Mr. Jürgenson (Estonia), Vice-President, took the Chair.

The meeting was called to order at 3.10 p.m.

Agenda item 8: Integration segment (*continued*)

Discussion on "Leaving no one behind: National perspectives on policymaking" (panel 2)

1. **The President** said that the panel discussion, entitled "Making it work: shared vision and innovative thinking in action", would address the need to adapt solutions to new priorities and circumstances, which was central to successful policymaking and implementation. Business as usual was no longer an option. Active engagement and ownership by a wide spectrum of groups in society would bring a broad pool of talent to the table, thereby expanding frontiers and fostering innovative approaches and solutions. Innovative partnerships and initiatives were spreading globally, which promised a future that was both sustainable and attainable, in the spirit of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.

2. **Ms. Kyte** (Special Representative of the Secretary-General for Sustainable Energy for All and Chief Executive Officer of the Sustainable Energy for All initiative), keynote speaker, asked participants to imagine the world in 2024, the final year of the United Nations Decade of Sustainable Energy for All 2014-2024 and a significant marking point on the road towards achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals. It was a world in which a clinic in Central Africa had a reliable electricity supply; the directors and senior managers attending a meeting of energy firm board members in London were primarily women; and a young woman cooking a meal in Bangladesh no longer had to worry about the impact of household air pollution on her child. All those scenarios represented integration.

3. The technology to make those scenarios a reality already existed, but the necessary institutions, policies and financing were lacking. Meeting Sustainable Development Goal 7 would contribute to the achievement of several other Goals. Affordable, clean energy for all was an enabler of good health, job creation, education and a better life for billions of the world's most vulnerable citizens.

4. "Win-win-win" solutions in the environmental, economic and social spheres were possible. For example, the gas flared annually from oil production could generate more than enough electricity to power the entire African continent and could save emissions equivalent to those of 77 million cars. An integrated solution in which many different stakeholders participated would be needed to end gas flaring, but it was within reach.

5. Integration worked well as a development concept used in the abstract to discuss sustainable development and climate change at the global level. Community leaders and elected officials, however, cared about local and national issues such as air pollution and unemployment. Solving those problems in an affordable way would also help reduce global emissions.

6. The Sustainable Development Goals portrayed a world that was inclusive and left no one behind. The agreement reached at the twenty-first session of the Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change painted a picture of a world of hope, opportunity and growth — and a world that had decoupled itself from carbon. Doubling the share of renewable energy in the global energy mix by 2030 would cut emissions, more than double the number of jobs in the energy sector and boost global gross domestic product (GDP) by up to $1.3 trillion. Nevertheless, support would be required for those who may be temporarily left behind, such as coal communities.

7. Prices were falling for new renewable technologies and far less energy would be needed to lift people out of poverty than even a few years earlier. In East Africa, cell phones were being used to transform the way in which people consumed energy. Subscribers to a mobile payment plan received a solar energy system to install in their homes, which provided them with access to clean, affordable energy for the first time.

8. The Sustainable Energy for All initiative was working to empower leaders, broker partnerships and unlock finance. Thousands of partners, including Governments, civil society and international organizations, had come together since the launch of the initiative in 2011 to work on different pieces of the puzzle. Those same stakeholders were now recommitting themselves to making an integrated

approach to energy a reality, as opposed to simply advocating for it.

9. A new energy mix would require a new, diversified and integrated group of energy leaders. If the energy sector of 2024 resembled the current one, it would have failed to go through the necessary transition. Currently, only six per cent of energy firm board members were women. Without diverse viewpoints in the boardroom, in management and in government, risk could not be properly appreciated, and it would be impossible to make the right risk-reward trade-offs. Integration meant integrating different perspectives into decision-making.

10. The Sustainable Energy for All initiative would work with any and all: with the 1.1 billion people who lacked access to energy; with the 2.9 billion who had no access to clean cooking; and with the major energy companies and users. Sustainable Development Goal 7 was entirely achievable and could be met even earlier than 2030; furthermore, unless progress was made, the world would not be on track to meet the objectives set at the twenty-first session of the Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change. Integrated solutions, voices and teams were essential.

11. **Ms. Dawes** (Professor Emerita, Rockefeller College of Public Affairs and Policy, University at Albany, State University of New York), moderator, said that the discussions would focus on action, including ways to turn policies into action on the ground. Although it was satisfying to talk of breaking silos down, in practice it might be necessary to work around them. A more useful metaphor could be that of "crossing boundaries". There were many boundaries to consider in the implementation of the 2030 Agenda, including the Goals themselves, the public, private and civil sectors, and different languages, cultures and ideas of good performance. Crossing boundaries could be a form of knowledge-sharing, a kind of risk-taking, and an act of learning.

12. The discussions would be guided by considerations regarding the nature of successful coalitions and inclusive partnerships; the way in which research could contribute to new thinking on development and measurement of progress; and how the application of new tools and technologies could open up new opportunities.

13. **Mr. Miller** (President and Chief Executive Officer of World Wildlife Fund Canada), panellist, said that the shared societies concept developed by Club de Madrid was the right way to think about achieving the Sustainable Development Goals in an integrated manner. All segments of society, particularly the most disadvantaged, must be included in discussions about their economic challenges and how to tackle them. In addition, what States measured mattered. The idea that growth was a proxy for economic success, social inclusion and equality had been proven to be wrong.

14. Everyone was aware of both the challenges and the pathway to success. Unfortunately, progress was too slow, many people were still being left behind, many systems were not fit for purpose, and sustainability was still a low priority. The Club de Madrid working group, of which he was a member, would shortly be issuing a report that would offer fresh ideas for tackling those problems based on its shared societies concept.

15. During his time in office as Mayor of Toronto, from 2003 to 2010, the first principle of the city's economic development strategy had been "One Toronto", which coincidentally stood for the idea that no one should be left behind. It had enabled the city to think and act in far more integrated ways, a case in point being the revitalization of Regent Park, a low-income neighbourhood whose housing was in decline. Before any proposals to rebuild were even drafted, the residents were asked about their needs. At their request, young people living in the neighbourhood were employed on the rebuilding project, which helped to meet economic needs. That policy was an example of integrated thinking between the economic and social sectors.

16. In 1992, Canada had been forced to close one of the largest cod fisheries in the world, off the coast of Newfoundland, because of a failure to pay sufficient attention to environmental sustainability. Within a month, 45,000 people had lost their jobs. World Wildlife Fund Canada was working to embed sustainability principles in the new cod fishery in Newfoundland, starting with the principle of working directly with communities. As a direct result of those activities, the first small cod fishery had recently received sustainability certification.

17. From the Club de Madrid perspective, certain questions should be asked of policy proposals at all

levels, from local to international. They included whether all sectors, particularly the most disadvantaged, had been involved in developing the policy, and what the potential impact on the environment would be. Club de Madrid, working in collaboration with representatives of intergovernmental agencies, had produced a Global Shared Societies Agenda, which set out the principles of an overarching framework that would enable a people-centred, inclusive approach.

18. In order to attain the Sustainable Development Goals and ensure that no one was left behind, everyone had to participate in the pursuit of economic equality. Otherwise, any achievements would be partial and inadequate. The United Nations system needed to keep that perspective at the centre of the process of implementing and monitoring policies and programmes to fulfil the 2030 Agenda.

19. **Mr. Ugarte Fuentes** (Executive Director, Socialab), panellist, said that Socialab was an online platform that helped entrepreneurs implement innovative solutions to poverty-related problems in Latin America, with a view to bringing a rapid end to poverty. Its online platform for submitting ideas had over 500,000 users. Projects that it had facilitated included the production of equipment that extracted water from the atmosphere in order to provide drinking water for families whose homes were not connected to a pipeline.

20. Fundamentally, issues such as lack of access to water were caused by greed or selfishness prevailing over concern for the welfare of others. However, for millennials, doing something meaningful with their lives was a higher priority than making money. Consumers in Latin America were also beginning to favour companies that demonstrated empathy or made people's lives better. Society seemed to be moving from a selfish, money-centric system towards an "economy of love" based on the idea that ethical businesses could be profitable. It was important to support entrepreneurs taking the risk of being socially responsible. In that connection, Socialab had supported 100 start-up businesses that had gone on to make a positive impact on the lives of 1 million people. The state of technology was not an obstacle to sustainable development; technology was advancing at an exponential rate. The challenge was to ensure that socially responsible businesses and projects to improve lives were financially profitable.

21. **Ms. Vaz** (Research Officer, Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative), panellist, accompanying her statement with a digital slide presentation, said that multidimensional poverty was often measured using a set of separate deprivation indicators, such as child mortality rates or the percentage of children not attending school. While that approach had its uses, it did not indicate whether or not the same families were experiencing more than one type of deprivation. The Alkire Foster method developed by the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative had filled that gap. It was a general and flexible method for capturing overlapping deprivations, which could be useful for the achievement of Sustainable Development Goal 1 on ending poverty in all its forms everywhere. The method was used to construct the global Multidimensional Poverty Index, which had been included in the Human Development Reports from the United Nation Development Programme since 2010.

22. The first step in using the methodology was to identify the poor. To do so, the user first had to decide what indicators to use and determine the cut-off point for a person or household to be considered deprived for each indicator. The indicators could be weighted equally or assigned different weights. People were identified as multidimensionally poor if the weighted sum of their deprivations was greater than or equal to a cut-off point determined by the user. For the global Multidimensional Poverty Index, a person was considered multidimensionally poor if they were deprived in a third or more of the indicators. Once the poor had been identified, the next step was to aggregate the data in a meaningful way. The methodology had three meaningful measures: incidence, intensity and the multidimensional poverty index. The incidence measure showed the proportion of people who were multidimensionally poor, but it did not differentiate between different levels of poverty beyond the cut-off point. The intensity measure was therefore useful, as it showed the average number of deprivations experienced by each person or household simultaneously. However, the key measure of poverty was the Multidimensional Poverty Index, or the adjusted headcount ratio, which was calculated by multiplying the incidence by the intensity. The Multidimensional Poverty Index could be disaggregated by group, for example to identify the poorest regions or ethnic groups.

23. The Multidimensional Poverty Index was an internationally comparable measure, but Governments were beginning to tailor the methodology to their particular contexts and priorities. The Multidimensional Poverty Peer Network had been established in 2013 to serve as a platform for sharing knowledge and experience concerning the implementation of measures to combat multidimensional poverty. It had begun with 20 members and now had 40.

24. **Mr. Seoane** (Peru) asked to what extent the Multidimensional Poverty Index could promote a more efficient allocation of the scant resources available for eradicating poverty. Noting that the report of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Sustainable Development Goal Indicators and the global indicator framework endorsed by Statistical Commission referred to national indicators for Sustainable Development Goal 1 while the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development called for the United Nations to develop global indicators in collaboration with the international financial institutions, he asked whether it was important to develop multidimensional poverty indicators at the global level, through the United Nations system.

25. **Ms. Vaz** (Research Officer, Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative) said that it enabled Governments to identify the poorest groups in the country and develop policies to target them. Some countries had already adopted such approaches; for example, in 2011 Colombia had begun using census data to identify the poorest municipalities and targeted investment accordingly. It had also used the data to create an online map indicating current investment and investment needs in order to enable those wishing to implement projects to target them effectively.

26. With regard to Sustainable Development Goal 1, in which States had agreed to reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions, it was important for countries to have their own poverty measures that they could use to guide policy. However, comparing progress between States on the basis of their national measurements was not recommended, as they were measuring different things. It would therefore be useful to have a global-level Multinational Poverty Index, which would be an improved version of the existing global Multinational Poverty Index, to ascertain whether multidimensional poverty had actually been reduced overall.

27. **Mr. Miller** (President and Chief Executive Officer, World Wildlife Fund Canada) said that the University of Toronto had used census data to carry out analyses similar to those of the Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative. The government of Toronto, in partnership with the private sector, non-governmental organizations and the provincial government, had used the data to direct public investment at the neighbourhoods with the highest correlation between low income and a historic lack of public investment. With regard to efficiency, the data provided by that type of research did not indicate where the greatest economic benefits were but rather where the economic need was greatest, enabling Governments wishing to address those needs to do so.

28. **Mr. Aguirre Vacchieri** (Chile) asked whether the term "economy of love" was a figure of speech or an established concept.

29. **Mr. Ugarte Fuentes** (Executive Director, Socialab) said that the economy of love was a concept that had originated in Chile. There was a revolution of sorts underway in his country that was bringing about a new kind of economy. The primary motivator in the world was still money, and competition over money promoted selfishness. However, Chilean consumers were beginning to take their business to companies that were acting ethically, for example by refusing to collude with the competition to artificially inflate prices. Love was a more abundant resource than money, and it was love that would bring about positive change. Money, technology and innovation were tools, not end goals; the end goal was a better society, based on love.

30. **Ms. Dawes** (Associate Professor Emerita, Rockefeller College of Public Affairs and Policy, State University of New York at Albany) asked how mechanisms could be developed to ensure that sustainable development policies reflected what was being learned, given that the weakest part of the public policy cycle was using results to develop better policies.

31. **Ms. Vaz** (Research Officer, Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative) said that the Multidimensional Poverty Peer Network was a mechanism that could help build better policies. The Network provided a space for States to share their experiences and for academics to share their research. Governments and the academic sector were now

working together on projects to gain insight into the relationship between specific policies and trends in multidimensional poverty. The Network also enabled academics to make sure that their research was relevant and useful by finding out what Governments needed from them.

32. **Mr. Ugarte Fuentes** (Executive Director, Socialab) said that conducting thorough impact studies was currently very slow and expensive. A study for a single project could take four years and cost up to $3 million. At that rate, the world would not be much better in 2030. With the technology that was available, it should be possible to find ways to measure impact more quickly and at a lower cost, and study more initiatives simultaneously, so that informed policies could be implemented more quickly.

33. **Mr. Miller** (President and Chief Executive Officer, World Wildlife Fund Canada) said that the concept of shared society, which implicitly assumed that experts were just one part of a process, was very important. The best planners of a city were the people who lived there. For example, a primary concern of residents in one neighbourhood of Toronto had been the lack of a nearby supermarket. That was a basic need, but not necessarily something that would have occurred to a city planner. Implementing that type of participatory approach at the national and international levels would mean creating mechanisms to ensure that the voices of the most affected populations were heard, understood and respected in the work of the national Government, local governments and non-governmental organizations.

34. **Ms. Vaz** (Research Officer, Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative) said that listening to affected populations was extremely important. A good example was the approach taken by the Government of El Salvador, which had identified the most deprived communities in the country, asked them what they felt they lacked and then developed measures to meet those needs.

35. **Mr. WU** Xun (Professor, and Associate Director of the Institute for Public Policy, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology), accompanying his statement with a digital slide presentation, said that he had been researching the subject of policy capacity. His work aimed to conceptualize the term itself and study how it could be applied to integrated policymaking for sustainable development.

36. Many successes and failures of integrated policymaking had a great deal to do with whether or not the concept could actually be implemented in the existing policy system. Impact assessments also tended to focus on the specific objectives of each policy and neglected to evaluate the integration of objectives from all three spheres of sustainable development.

37. His research into the challenges of implementing integrated policymaking had shown that the key issue was policy capacity, which could be broken down into three dimensions: analytical capacity, operational capacity and political capacity. Analytical capacity had been emphasized for some time, but relatively little research had been carried out on political and operational capacity. In addition, when considering the implementation of integrated policymaking, there was a tendency to focus on policy capacity at the system level, typically at the country level, but policy capacity at the organization and individual levels was equally important.

38. At the individual level, professionals involved in the policymaking process, such as legislators and representatives of non-governmental organizations, should each be able to demonstrate political, analytical and operational capacity.

39. The same was true of organizations. In terms of analytical capacity, they needed to have access to good advice and analysis, whether in-house or externally. Political legitimacy in the policymaking process was an indicator of political capacity at the organization level, while effective coordination within an organization was an example of operational capacity.

40. Policy capacity at the system level could refer to the policymaking process within a particular local government, sector or country. The system-wide collection and sharing of economic, social and environmental data was an indicator of analytical capacity, while public trust in government helped to push through change and was a key component of political capacity.

41. The policy capacity framework he had presented could be useful for identifying gaps. For example, a particular policymaker might score highly on political and operational capacity but might be lacking in analytical capacity. Within countries, individual and organization capacity might be high, but system capacity might be low.

42. **Ms. Dawes** (Professor Emerita, Rockefeller College of Public Affairs and Policy, University at Albany, State University of New York) said that the ideas about capacities and levels were very much in keeping with the idea of crossing boundaries and identifying strengths and weaknesses and areas for investment.

43. **Ms. Thörnelöf** (Sweden) said that Sweden had established a system of environmental goals, but agreement could not be reached on how to follow them up and whether indicators should be created. It had also become clear that views on the nature of the system were completely different depending on who was being asked. She wondered whether monitoring indicators significantly influenced the policy cycle and how evaluations translated into new policy measures. She was also interested to know whether the failure to take action over the declining cod stock in Canada had been due to weaknesses in monitoring or in policy.

44. **Mr. WU Xun** (Professor, and Associate Director of the Institute for Public Policy, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology), focusing on the capacity-building angle, said that the experiences of policy stakeholders did indeed condition their views. Organizations that were most successful in integrating different objectives made a conscious effort to bring people with diverse backgrounds together. Inter-agency or system-wide integration had been the subject of considerable attention, but integration at the individual and organization level could also play a very important role in driving progress in the short term.

45. **Mr. Miller** (President and Chief Executive Officer, World Wildlife Fund Canada) said that in the case of the closure of the cod fishery off the coast of Newfoundland, Canada, as a result of over-fishing, the failure was not an analytical failure but a political failure to make use of the available data owing to fears over the negative impact that reigning in unsustainable fishing practices would have had on the incomes of households in the area and the political consequences that would ensue. In the end, action was delayed until it was too late. There were parallels to be drawn with the current difficulty of convincing all Governments to acknowledge the scientific evidence for climate change and to take appropriate action. It was also worth noting that political solutions were sometimes more difficult to achieve if it was possible to shift the blame. Just as the Canadian Government had pointed the finger at foreign fishing trawlers in the cod-fishing crisis and failed to properly consider its own role, smaller countries often argued that they should not have to limit their resource development for the sake of the environment, claiming that the responsibility for combating climate change lay with larger countries.

46. **Ms. Sorto** (Observer for El Salvador) said that in 2015 her country had developed a new tool to measure multidimensional poverty, which had moved away from traditional, income-based measuring to focusing on well-being. The Government had adopted 20 indicators approved by various sectors, including vulnerable populations, covering education, housing, work and social security, health, basic services, food security and the quality of the environment. The tool had made it possible to formulate, coordinate and evaluate public policies to promote people-centred sustainable development. Her country had also included the input of 1,500 vulnerable persons in two national reports that had determined its position in the negotiations on the 2030 Agenda. As part of the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals, her Government intended to create a national sustainable development council in which vulnerable populations, the academic sector, the Government and the United Nations system would participate.

47. **Princess** Abze **Djigma** (Chief Executive Officer, AbzeSolar S.A.) asked what could be done to ensure the quality of data.

48. **Ms. Vaz** (Research Officer, Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative) said that measures were only as good as the data used. The best way to ensure the quality of data would be through capacity-building for the national statistical offices. Some international organizations collected their own data, but national statistical offices should have an increasing role, as they knew the country better and could collect much more data. Large organizations did, however, have a role to play in collecting comparable data, for example to calculate the global Multinational Poverty Index.

49. The Multidimensional Poverty Peer Network had contributed to improving data quality by developing an easy-to-use questionnaire for collecting standardized data on multidimensional poverty.

50. **Mr. Wu Xun** (Professor and Associate Director, Institute for Public Policy, Hong Kong University of Science) said that making data accessible to more groups could be key to improving the quality of the

data, as it would increase the likelihood of potential gaps in data collection and analysis being identified.

51. **Ms. Dawes** (Associate Professor Emerita, Rockefeller College of Public Affairs and Policy, State University of New York at Albany) asked what the United Nations could do to help turn knowledge into action and what types of approaches, services and activities it could sponsor to facilitate the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals.

52. **Mr. Ugarte Fuentes** (Executive Director, Socialab) said that innovation did not usually originate in Governments and large international organizations, in part because they tended to be risk-averse. In contrast, entrepreneurs and start-ups were generally more in tune with market needs and had a greater awareness of how technology could be used to create value but lacked the financial resources to test and develop their ideas. Socialab had received proposals for more than 20,000 projects from 96 countries but did not have the capacity to finance all of them. The United Nations should therefore do more to support innovators and find ways to scale up the solutions that they had developed for poverty-related problems. That would involve being prepared to assume a certain amount of risk, but the solutions that would best enable the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals would not be developed unless innovators were able to experiment and were allowed to fail at times. He therefore encouraged the United Nations to be open to failure.

53. **Ms. Vaz** (Research Officer, Oxford Poverty and Human Development Initiative) said while United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) country offices and the Human Development Reports might not create innovation, they were good vehicles for disseminating innovation. For example, the Multidimensional Poverty Index had been launched through the Human Development Report, while country offices often shared new ideas with Governments and assisted with implementation of those ideas in the field.

54. **Mr. Miller** (President and Chief Executive Officer, World Wildlife Fund Canada) said that if the United Nations and other institutions accepted the concept of shared society, they should consider more carefully how to build alliances and networks with city and municipal authorities. There should be a better way for organizations such as the C40 Cities Climate Leadership Group, which had committed to a set of climate actions that, if completed, would reduce greenhouse gases by an amount approximately equivalent to the emissions of India, to participate in the deliberations of the Conference of the Parties to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change so that lessons learned from the bottom could information policy discussions at the highest level. The observer status of the World Wildlife Fund in the Arctic Council had allowed the Council to hear the Fund's expertise on issues affecting nature while enabling the Fund to become a more sophisticated commentator. The United Nations worked well in many areas but needed to ensure that not-for-profit organizations played an active role in establishing the link between broad policy-making and action on the ground.

55. **Mr. Wu Xun** (Professor and Associate Director, Institute for Public Policy, Hong Kong University of Science) said that the reach of the United Nations put it in a good position to develop good practices for sustainable development. When examining successful initiatives, there should be more focus on the mechanisms and processes than on the success in and of itself. Furthermore, while global agencies often tended to think in terms of global applications, it should be borne in mind that global strategies could be difficult to apply in the area of integrated policy-making. A better approach might to work with individual countries to develop operational manuals and then compare those manuals to see if there were similarities between them that could be of global relevance.

56. There had not been enough integrated policy-making because of a lack of attention to the political and operational spheres. In principle, no one opposed a balanced approach giving equal attention to analytical, political and operational capacity; however, significant political and operational obstacles meant that those areas had not been addressed with the same rigour as had been devoted to enhancing analytical capacity.

57. **Mr. Al-Musawi** (Iraq) said that the United Nations had 70 years of experience of successes and failures in attempting to develop innovative and integrated policies on various issues, including the "Delivering as one" initiative and the many missions with the word "integrated" in their titles. The United Nations should examine that experience to determine how best to break down silos and redistribute

responsibilities to make the system as efficient as possible and how to manage synergies in such a way as to ensure that the achievement of one Sustainable Development Goal contributed to the achievement of others.

58. **Ms. Bammer** (National Centre for Epidemiology Population Health, Research School of Population Health, Australian National University) said that data was not always available when policies had to be made, so it was important to determine how best to take the unknown into account in making the best possible decision in the absence of data.

59. **Ms. Dawes** (Associate Professor Emerita, Rockefeller College of Public Affairs and Policy, State University of New York at Albany) said that the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals would require crossing boundaries in order to work at all levels and in various directions: from the bottom up, the top down and the outside in. It would also require every element of society to be able to participate and be understood, from the largest institutions to the smallest communities. Supporting innovation and experimentation, learning from success and learning from failure would all contribute to the achievement of the Goals.

The meeting rose at 5.20 p.m.